

ECONOMY SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

**MEETING TO BE HELD AT 10.00 AM ON WEDNESDAY, 15 MARCH
2023
IN CONFERENCE ROOM 1/2, WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50
WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS, LS1 2DE**

A G E N D A

Please note that this meeting will be filmed for live or subsequent broadcast via the Combined Authority's internet site. At the start of the meeting the Chair will confirm if all or part of the meeting is being filmed. Generally, the public seating areas will not be filmed; however, by entering the meeting room and using the public seating area, you are consenting to being filmed and to the possible use of those images and sound recordings for webcasting. If you have any queries regarding this, please contact Governance Services on 0113 251 7220.

- 1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**
To note apologies and confirm the quorum of 11 members is met.
- 2. DECLARATIONS OF DISCLOSABLE PECUNIARY INTERESTS**
- 3. POSSIBLE EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS AND PUBLIC**
- 4. MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 16 NOVEMBER 2022**
(Pages 1 - 6)
- 5. NOTES OF THE INQUORATE MEETING HELD ON 18 JANUARY 2023**
(Pages 7 - 10)
- 6. CHAIR'S COMMENTS AND UPDATE**
- 7. MAYOR'S QUESTION TIME - TRACY BRABIN**
(Pages 11 - 20)
- 8. ECONOMY SCRUTINY WORK PROGRAMME**
(Pages 21 - 30)

Signed:



**Managing Director
West Yorkshire Combined Authority**



**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
ECONOMY SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
HELD ON WEDNESDAY, 16 NOVEMBER 2022 AT CONFERENCE
ROOM 1/2, WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-50 WELLINGTON STREET,
LEEDS, LS1 2DE**

Present:

Councillor Aneela Ahmed	Bradford Council
Councillor Gohar Almass	Leeds City Council
Councillor Helen Brundell	Calderdale Council
Councillor Stephen Fenton	City of York Council
Councillor Sam Firth	Leeds Council
Councillor Tyler Hawkins	Kirklees Council
Councillor Zafar Iqbal	Bradford Council
Councillor Isabel Owen	Wakefield Council
Councillor Chris Pillai (Deputy Chair)	Calderdale Council
Councillor Ian Sanders	Wakefield Council
Councillor Audrey Smith	Calderdale Council
Councillor Richard Smith (Chair)	Kirklees Council
Councillor Tony Wallis	Wakefield Council
Councillor Geoff Winnard	Bradford Council

In attendance:

Khaled Berroum	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Michelle Burton	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Lindsey Daniels	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Peter Glover	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Hannah Scales	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Philip Witcherley	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

1. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence was received from Councillors Gwen Lowe, Colin Campbell, Bob Felstead and Andrew Hollyer – with Councillors Fenton and Winnard substituting.

The meeting was confirmed as quorate, with 14 members present out of 11 needed for quorum.

2. Declarations of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

There were no declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests.

3. Possible exclusion of the press and public

1. To highlight appendix 2 to agenda item 7c which officers have identified as containing exempt information within the meaning of schedule 12a to the local government act 1972, and where officers consider that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information, for the reasons outlined in the report.

2. To consider whether or not to accept the officers' recommendation in respect of the above information.

3. If the recommendation is accepted, to formally pass the following resolution:

-

Resolved: That in accordance with paragraph 3 of part 1 of schedule 12a to the local government act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting during consideration of appendix 2 to agenda item 7c on the grounds that it is likely, in view of the nature of the business to be transacted or the nature of the proceedings, that if members of the press and public were present there would be disclosure to them of exempt information and that in all the circumstances of the case, the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighs the public interest in disclosing the information.

4. Minutes of the last meeting held on 9 March 2022

Resolved: That the minutes of the meeting held on 9 March 2022 be approved.

5. Notes of the Inquorate meeting held on 21 September 2022

Resolved: That the notes of the inquorate meeting held on 21 September 2022 be noted and entered as public record of what was discussed.

6. Chair's comments and update

The Chair welcomed members and invited the interim Director of Economic Services to provide an introduction.

Resolved: That the Chair's verbal update be noted.

7. Labour Market Evidence

The Committee was provided with an overview of key labour market issues and context to support discussion.

- **Unemployment Claimant Count:** Through inferences, national data was not showing a severe impact due to the cost-of-living crisis at the current time. The claimant count had continued falling since early 2021, albeit remaining higher than pre-pandemic levels.
- **Labour Shortages and Apprenticeships:** Current challenges in the labour market were discussed including labour shortages and staff

retention issues, particularly in specialist roles. Around 20% of employment in West Yorkshire was public sector and pay was rising by around 2% as opposed to the private sector 7% average increase. Members discussed the impact of Brexit and heard that approximately one third of the labour deficit was due to Brexit (migration). There is a growing demand in higher skilled areas such as digital and ICT, and most of the job growth has been in hospitality and service roles which reopened after COVID. There are still some industries which have struggled to recruit such as manufacturing. Some 'semi-skilled' roles such as secretarial support are also in decline and struggling to recruit. Apprenticeships had reduced during the pandemic due to lower vacancies but are now picking up again.

- **Minority ethnic groups assessment:** The CA is due to publish a report analysing the labour market in the context of minority ethnic groups, in order to determine qualification, employment and attainment in these communities and where some groups perform better than the majority and where some groups perform worse.

Resolved:

- i) That the report be noted, and the Committee's feedback and conclusions be considered further.
- ii) That the EDI labour report be circulated to members when ready.

8. Current Programmes for Young People

The Committee was provided with an overview of current Combined Authority programmes to support young people's careers.

- **Source of Funding:** The Combined Authority delivers programmes and commissions employment and skills provision to support employers and adults some of which is funded through devolved sources, and some externally funded including by Department for Education, Careers and Enterprise Company and Department for Work and Pensions.
- **NEETs and School Engagement:** Members heard that the proportion of NEETs (Young people not in education, employment, or training) was higher than the national average at 8% in Leeds. Young people with educational and mental health needs were more likely to be NEETs. More work is needed to determine why certain people are NEETs and how to engage with them. The Committee was keen to understand why the destination of some young people was unknown, (not in employment, training, or claiming benefits). Most businesses were keen to engage with students and young people but did not know how and the challenge is identifying these businesses in order to link them into existing engagement networks.
- **'Future Goals':** The 'Future Goals' platform was explained, with over three million users (including schools) the website had a sizeable reach.

Members wished to know more about the platform and receive data in regard to who was using the platform and where they were geographically based in order to monitor and evaluate success.

- **Apprenticeships:** The challenge of gender stereotyping in apprenticeships was discussed, and the importance of engaging with young people at an earlier stage to negate this. The question of wages was also discussed, with lower uptake in apprenticeships linked to pay that was lower than the national minimum wage.

Resolved: That the report be noted, and the Committee's feedback and conclusions be considered further.

9. Adult Education Budget

The Committee received a report which outlined the Adult Education Budget (AEB) and the changes made through devolution.

- **AEB Background:** The Combined Authority has had the AEB (£65 million annually) since August 2021 which was the underpinning budget for adult education in West Yorkshire. The budget existed prior to devolution but now, the Combined Authority had a direct relationship with providers and managed the budget directly. Approximately £62 million had been used, however, the remaining funds stood and could be reinvested in future. This does not constitute additional money, but just a change in responsibility between national government and WYCA.
- **Funding:** The allocation process was described as demand led and based on pre-calculated amounts, which is why Kirklees, for instance, receives much less than Leeds. The previous allocations and system were retained in order protected the stability of the system and a review of the system of funding which might possibly result in retargeted funding in future is under discussion. Currently, strategic conversations are taking place about what funding is required, instead of what has always been spent before the allocations can be reviewed. An update can be provided in future.

Resolved: That the report be noted, and the Committee's feedback and conclusions be considered further.

10. Future Employment and Skills Programmes

The Committee received a report which detailed devolved funding such as Adult Education Budget, Local Digital Skills Partnership, and delegated funding for free courses for jobs. In addition, the Gainshare multi-year settlement and the notional allocations the Combined Authority had made to each investment priority in the West Yorkshire Investment Strategy (WYIS) including £21m notional allocation for Investment Priority 2 'People and Skills'.

Skills for Growth Scheme: Members were reminded of the Skills for Growth scheme that aims to connect small and medium sized business owners with

the region's 'top talent' such as local schools, colleges, and universities. This aimed to assist access to apprenticeship, graduate and intern opportunities that meet business needs.

Resolved: That the report be noted, and the Committee's feedback and conclusions be considered further.

11. For Information - Economic Update

The Committee received an update report and were invited to submit any questions or discuss the content further outside of the meeting with the Interim Director of Economic Services.

Resolved: That the report be noted.

12. Economy Scrutiny Work Programme

The Committee considered the Work programme for 2022/23 and discussed the addition of Enterprise Zones to the 18 January 2023 Agenda. Members were also interested in building on the discussion regarding young people and engagement with schools at a future meeting.

Resolved: That the appended 2022/23 Work Programme be noted.

13. Date of the next meeting - 18 January 2023

This page is intentionally left blank

Notes: Inquorate Economy Scrutiny Committee held on 18 January 2023

Item 1 – Apologies and Quorum

Attendees (9/11): Richard Smith, Chris Pillai, Bob Felstead, Gwen Lowe, Audrey Smith, Gohar Almass (until 11.20), Helen Brundell, Andrew Hollyer, Isabel Owen

Apologies (6): Aneela Ahmed, Zafar Iqbal, Colin Campbell, Ian Sanders, Tony Wallis, Sam Firth

Officers: Kate Thompson, Phil Witcherley, Jennifer Robson, Hannah Scales, Khaled Berroum, James Briggs

Skipped items 2 and 3 as the meeting was inquorate.

Item 4 – Minutes from the last meeting on 16 November 2022

Some Members suggested the minutes didn't capture the full discussion and Cllr Smith asked members to email specifics to officers, but minutes are not intended to be verbatim. Minutes must be approved at next quorate meeting (scheduled for 15 March 2023) alongside the notes of this inquorate session.

Item 5 – Chairs comments

The Chair thanked officers for rearranging meeting as virtual one at late notice due to pre-confirmed inquoracy. The Chair also expressed disappointed at the lack of quoracy, asked officers to review the schedule next year to avoid any future clashes, and asked members to confirm their attendance at future meetings in good time.

Item 6 – Economic Plan

Members were provided with a report and presentation outlining the work to date to develop an Economic Plan for the region.

Questions and discussion centred around:

- **Other overlapping plans / strategies:** There is a concern that, with too many plans and strategies, the CA may struggle to monitor attainment of them effectively, and that many of them may overlap. The current plan is to review all existing plans and strategies as part of a new approach wherein a new encompassing 'West Yorkshire Plan' acts as an apex of a suite of strategies which all feed into its overall goals – the Economic Plan will sit below that. The thing that differs this particular plan from other economic strategies is that the Economic Plan is more long-term looking, based on a series of projections ranging from best case to worst case scenarios, and focuses on the entire economy divided into 'enabling', 'strategic' and 'vital' sectors, rather than just on 'high growth' or high-profile sectors common in shorter term plans. Members requested to see the plan again once it was developed, alongside the review of other relevant plans.
- **Alignment between councils and districts:** It is important that the Economic Plan takes into account existing economic plans in the constituent councils and that these are all aligned. A task and finish group of each of the councils has been established, and close work is being undertaken by relevant policy leads and directors in each council and the CA. The final Plan will also be reviewed, and approved by, the LEP

Board and the CA's Business Committee which include senior representation from each council, alongside private sector business representatives to represent various areas and sectors. The council areas also have very differently sized economies, with Leeds understood to be £30bn in GDP and Bradford next at £11bn. A lot more work is needed to ensure a degree of 'levelling up' within the region.

- **Challenge of carbon emissions and inclusivity:** The Plan includes a goal for the economy to become carbon neutral by 2038 and ensure benefits are felt by all in an inclusive way, including by creating 'good jobs' not just jobs. Some feel this might present a conflict with economic growth in general, particularly in certain sectors such as manufacturing, which emit more carbon in general – especially without more investment and support to help those businesses emit less carbon. A review of the entire economy is underway to assess where such support might be necessary to promote less carbon emissions and better paying jobs, debates about a 'circular' and sustainable economy are ongoing, and the biggest employers in the region are the councils and the NHS.
- **Necessity of financial and infrastructure investment:** It would be a challenge to achieve the most positive projections of economic growth without enough investment in key infrastructure, such as transport, and in skills and education, which wouldn't be within the CA's current purview, instead relying on funding from the central government. This is a common challenge across the entire North, not just in West Yorkshire (WY). In WY, the levels of national investment and subsidies in the region is understood to differ by area, with Leeds understood to be subsidised at ten times the rate that the next area Bradford is, according to ONS data seen by Members. Officers will consider the possibility of further subsidies and will pursue that lead.

Item 7 - Business Spaces and Enterprise Zones

Members were provided with a report and presentation outlining the Enterprise Zones programme and issues relating to the availability of space for businesses in the region.

Questions and discussion centred around:

- **Success and performance of Enterprise Zones (EZs):** The 2017 EZs sites have not yet had the time to impact job creation as expected, with an estimated one-third of expected jobs currently created. The evidence suggests that where authorities can help unlock the stalled EZs sites, investment and the private sector does follow. The oldest, and most successful EZ site, Leeds Aire Valley, took a while to develop but is now fully built and filled. The Gain Lane site was stalled for 15 years prior to EZ designation and the investment of Local Growth Funds (LGF) which enabled capital infrastructure to be developed, and that site is now also full. One area of challenge was that the original vision of attracting *advanced* manufacturing has only succeeded in pockets. Another is that there is some displacement from other areas as companies move to EZs to expand. There is no evidence that there is any adverse effect of competition between EZs which are close to each other in different districts.
- **Level and use of business rates income:** EZs include both business rates relief up to £250,000 for five years for businesses based in them by March 2022 and allow WYCA to retain any business rates revenue generated thereafter until 2042. The projections for business rates revenue were last completed in 2020 when LGF funding was coming to a close and is currently around £2.5m income per annum. To date this revenue was redirected into supporting core business support services at the CA. Members asked about current business rates income and future projected income and

wondered if this could possibly be ringfenced for investment into further revenue generating activities. The LEP has strategic oversight of the EZs and it is understood that the government may reform LEPs further in future, but this should not have a negative impact as the CA acts as the accountable body for both the LEP and for retained business rates. The CA has not performed impact assessments on lost business rates for the local authorities, which they may have done themselves, but in one example, some of the early development of the Aire Valley site (the link road) involved borrowing and Leeds Council was repaid using some of the rates from that site.

- **Demands for space and offices in the region:** Further research is still needed to determine exactly what business needs are with regards to space and if it is suitable for them to expand into and why they have or haven't expanded – in addition to further work to identify all available spaces across the region. Most reports are currently anecdotal and need collating into something more quantifiable and data based. Demands for office space has changed since the pandemic and it is not yet clear what the long-term effect is, as it is a complex picture. There is still the challenge of businesses seeking to move into the region preferring Leeds city centre spaces, but big developments in other council areas such as Bradford's One City Park has shown that there is growing demand for space there too. The CA's inward investment teams which support businesses relocating to the area promote all parts of the region and ensure that businesses are aware of offers outside of Leeds centre.

Item 8 – Economy Scrutiny Work Programme

The Chair reminded members that the next meeting, on 15 March, was the Mayor's Question Time (MQT) and he hoped that the line of questioning will progress in scope to take into account the fact that the Mayor is now over the half way point in her term. A workshop for members to plan the approach to MQT is scheduled for 21 February.

Next meeting date – 15 March 2023

This page is intentionally left blank



Report to: Economy Scrutiny Committee

Date: 15 March 2023

Subject: **Mayors Question Time**

Director: Melanie Corcoran, Chief Operating Officer

Author: Hannah Scales, Scrutiny Support Officer

1. Purpose of this report

1.1 To introduce the Mayor's Question Time session.

2. Information

- 2.1 Every year the Mayor of West Yorkshire is invited to each of the Combined Authority's scrutiny committees at least once to answer the Committee's questions, on any matter related to that committee's remit, in a public and live-webcast setting.
- 2.2 It is an opportunity for Scrutiny Members to hold the Mayor directly to account for the policies they adopt, the money they spend, the decisions they make, the services they are delivering and the outcomes they are achieving for the people of West Yorkshire.
- 2.3 The session will be divided into sections, each with a topic heading, which members can ask related questions on; every member will have the opportunity to speak and ask follow-up questions to their original question.
- 2.4 This session will aim to focus on the following economy-related areas, amongst others, including:
- Business support, engagement and investment
 - Jobs, skills and training
 - Funding, strategy and projections
- 2.5 The Mayor is permitted to invite relevant senior officers of the Combined Authority – such as the Chief Executive or a relevant Director – to join them at the session.

- 2.6 The minutes of the last Mayors Question Time session at the Economy Scrutiny Committee, which took place on 9 March 2022, is attached as **Appendix 1** for information.
- 2.7 This year the Mayor is scheduled to attend the following Mayor’s Question Times at scrutiny committees:

Date	Committee	Time	Location
18 November 2022	Corporate Scrutiny	10am	Wellington House, Leeds
19 January 2023	Transport Scrutiny	10am	Wellington House, Leeds
15 March 2023	Economy Scrutiny	10am	Wellington House, Leeds

3. Tackling the Climate Emergency Implications

- 3.1. There are no climate emergency implications directly arising from this report.

4. Inclusive Growth Implications

- 4.1. There are no inclusive growth implications directly arising from this report.

5. Equality and Diversity Implications

- 5.1. There are no equality and diversity implications directly arising from this report.

6. Financial Implications

- 6.1. There are no financial implications directly arising from this report.

7. Legal Implications

- 7.1. There are no legal implications directly arising from this report.

8. Staffing Implications

- 8.1. There are no staffing implications directly arising from this report.

9. External Consultees

- 9.1. No external consultations have been undertaken.

10. Recommendations

- 10.1 To question the Mayor of West Yorkshire, Tracy Brabin, on matters pertaining to the remit of the Economy Scrutiny Committee.

11. Background Documents

None.

12. Appendices

Appendix 1 – Minutes: Economy Scrutiny Mayors Question Time – 9 March 2022

This page is intentionally left blank



**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
ECONOMY SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
HELD ON WEDNESDAY, 9 MARCH 2022 AT WELLINGTON HOUSE, 40-
50 WELLINGTON STREET, LEEDS LS1 2DE**

Present:

Councillor Aneela Ahmed	Bradford Council
Councillor Stephen Baines MBE (Deputy Chair)	Calderdale Council
Councillor Jonathan Bentley	Leeds City Council
Councillor Kayleigh Brooks	Leeds City Council
Councillor Dawn Collins	Leeds City Council
Councillor Bob Felstead	Bradford Council
Councillor Tony Hames	Wakefield Council
Councillor Andrew Hollyer	City of York Council
Councillor Susan Press	Calderdale Council
Councillor Audrey Smith	Calderdale Council
Councillor Richard Smith (Chair)	Kirklees Council
Councillor Harpreet Uppal	Kirklees Council
Councillor Tony Wallis	Wakefield Council

In attendance:

Mayor Tracy Brabin	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Brian Archer	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Khaled Berroum	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Judith Furlonger	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Alison Gillespie	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Thomas Purvis	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Hannah Scales	West Yorkshire Combined Authority
Philip Witcherley	West Yorkshire Combined Authority

10. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Rowley, Kaushik and Iqbal.

The meeting was confirmed as quorate with 12 members present out of 11 needed for quorum.

11. Declarations of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests

here were no declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests.

12. Possible exclusion of the press and public

There were no items requiring the exclusion of the press and public.

13. Minutes of the meeting held on 17 November 2021

Resolved: That the notes of the inquorate meeting held on 17 November 2021 be noted and entered as public record of what was discussed.

14. Notes of the informal meeting held on 19 January 2022

Members asked that the notes capture their view that social housing was an important element in achieving more affordable housing.

Resolved: That the notes of the informal meeting held on 19 January 2022 be noted and entered as public record of what was discussed, pending the above amendment.

15. Chair's comments and update

The Committee received a verbal update from the Chair. Members noted the initial proposed changes to the Committee structure and plans going forward to transfer place/environment work from the Economy Scrutiny Committee remit to Transport Scrutiny Committee, an update to follow. The Committee also heard that a wrap-up session was due to be arranged for the end of the year to discuss lessons learned, evaluate performance and forward plan for the coming year.

Considering the economic impact of the Ukraine crisis and the sanctions on Russia and freezing of assets, the Chair invited the Director of Economic Services to give a brief update. Key points from the update included:

- The challenge of significant inflationary pressures due to inflation which was 5.5% two weeks prior to the meeting and was expected to rise to 7%. An example of the impact was the cost of gas which was 20p per therm last year compared to the current price, £2.24 per therm.
- According to statistics there was 158 companies in West Yorkshire currently exporting to Russia. Members heard that a large number of businesses had grown on the back of Russian brands, and it would have an impact on some companies more than others.
- Food production - around 25% of global wheat production was from Russia and Ukraine.
- Cyber security – the crisis had significantly increased the risk of cyber-attacks and hacking, with one local firm saying they were not going public with the help they were giving Ukraine with fear of cyber-attacks.
- The long-term impact of stability was evident, investors had been moving out of public investments to gold and currency. There were increased regulatory burdens expected also.
- In-work Universal Credit claims had increased while business liquidations had stabilised in the new year.

Resolved: That the Chair's verbal update and the Director's update on

economic impact be noted.

16. Economy Scrutiny Work Programme

The Committee considered the Work programme for 2021/22. The Annual Report was due to be produced and short wrap-up sessions arranged for each Scrutiny Committee.

Resolved: That the report and comments be noted.

17. Mayors Question Time - Tracy Brabin

The Chair thanked the Mayor Tracy Brabin for attending Economy Scrutiny to answer the Committee's questions and outlined the format of the Mayor's Question Time. The session would be split into pre-agreed topic areas and members would be able to ask any questions under those topic areas, and any follow ups.

The topic areas were:

- Partnerships and delivery
- Skills and jobs
- Businesses
- Culture
- Housing

Following questions and supplementary questions, the following was reported to the committee:

1. Partnerships and Delivery

- **Quality of partnerships:** the Mayor felt that the Local Authorities were aligned and working well together, they all had similar challenges and agreed on solutions.
- **Delivery capacity:** Gainshare was being used to support each member authority in developing a pipeline of projects ready for bidding in new government funding announcements. The Mayor felt government didn't understand delivery capacity issues facing local government and was too demanding in the number of funding announcements and the limited time to deadlines requiring resources to be spent on bidding.
- **York:** West Yorkshire worked with York on various joint schemes, not just in transport, but also in business. Further devolution to York was supported as it would also benefit West Yorkshire.
- **Leeds-centricity & West Yorkshire levelling up:** Members had the perception of Leeds centricity. Other cities and towns felt side-lined, particularly on office space. Wakefield Council was bidding for the new Rail HQ, but it was bidding against larger areas/authorities such as Doncaster, Preston and York.

2. Jobs and skills

- **Labour shortages:** Members heard of the use of the Adult Education Budget (AEB) budget to respond to reactive labour needs such as the

HGV driver training during the recent shortage.

- **Green jobs:** There was demand for green jobs in the development of EV charging infrastructure and EV mechanics, retrofitting homes opportunities and the use of AEB funding to help. Members wished to know the definition of a 'green job'; to ensure it was not the marketing industry 'greenwashing' campaigns, but direct jobs for example as EV related workers and electric boiler fitters.
- **Parent workers:** The importance of support for parent workers, particularly women.
- **Over 50s:** The CA wanted to support people to reskill as their careers progressed. Older workers had been positively targeted through the employment Hub to help people get back into work.
- **University engagement:** The Mayor had regular meetings with Vice Chancellors encouraging positive engagement. The Mayor emphasised to importance of careers advice, working with businesses and helping young people make important choices.

3. Business

- **Support for small businesses:** historically economic development policy focussed on businesses with growth potential. There were various versatile initiatives to support small/medium sized businesses including integral local, community businesses such as 'corner shops' which may not be looking to grow.
- **Cost of living:** the cost-of-living crisis was affecting business costs/expenses and there were schemes in place to advise/fund businesses helping them in reducing energy costs through greater efficiency.
- **Grants vs advice;** Members felt that on occasion, businesses needed invaluable advice rather than money – which the CA did also provide in its services.
- **Late payments:** Businesses and in particular small businesses struggled with late/backdated payments which was a recognised issue. Members heard this problem was addresses as part of the 'Fair Work Charter' and other initiatives.
- **Inclusive growth:** Members felt there was a lack of clarity around the definition of 'inclusive growth' and whether the CA sought to make only the new growth element inclusive or the entire existing economy inclusive. Members heard that the goal was to grow the economy further and in an inclusive way that shared the benefits of growth. Some work such as the 'Fair Work Charter' sought to make the existing economy fairer and more inclusive.
- **Leeds Bradford Airport (LBA):** LBA was considered an example of the tension and conflict between economic growth and the climate emergency action. Expanding the airport would lead to increased carbon emissions but the Mayor felt that the region couldn't remain competitive with other regions without its own modern airport.

4. Housing

- **House production rate:** The rate of housing development hadn't increased in 10 years, which had contributed to the rising house prices.
- **MCA housing powers:** Members understood that the CA/Mayor can't

build houses, but the CA could help Local Authorities deal with issues such as land-banking through Compulsory Purchase Orders (CPO) or develop less viable land through devolved funding.

- **Viability of land:** The majority of land especially in districts such as Calderdale was harder to develop due to the area's terrain. The Brownfield Fund was designed to help councils develop such difficult land, that requires a lot more funding to make viable.
- **Social/council housing:** 5000 'affordable' homes target did not include a specific proportion as social housing. Members of the public often viewed affordable housing as social housing for rent. Members thought the affordable housing definitions were too subjective – what was affordable for one, may not be affordable for another.
- **Developers:** Members discussed that far too often developers agreed to develop affordable housing, then under technicalities renege on their agreements by citing lack of profitability due to 'unforeseen' viability costs after the fact. Members heard that an area in Horsforth gave up greenbelt land for a development of affordable housing and did not get any in the end. Members discussed the possibility of Mayoral soft power being utilised by identifying good and bad developers who adhere to agreements.
- **'Wellness' and 'place':** Price was not the only factor for good housing; also access and connectivity to amenities such as food and transport were equally as desirable. It was not just about houses, it was also about the area and place, an example being those fortunate to have garden space during the pandemic compared to people who didn't.

5. Culture

- **Networking and inclusivity:** Creative industries are centred around networking, contacts and relationship building. This could put people from various social classes at a disadvantage. It was suggested that peer networking opportunities should be part of the Creative Catalyst and Channel 4 programmes.
- **Culture and wider regeneration:** This could create a wide range of jobs in acting, producing, writing, digital, marketing, building, logistics and hospitality to contribute to wider economic growth.

Resolved: That the Mayor be thanked for attending and the Committee's feedback and conclusions be considered further.

This page is intentionally left blank



Report to: Economy Scrutiny Committee

Date: 15 March 2023

Subject: **Economy Scrutiny Work Programme 2022/23**

Director: Melanie Corcoran, Chief Operating Officer

Author: Hannah Scales, Scrutiny Support Officer

1. Purpose of this report

- 1.1 To note the final, summarised Economy Scrutiny Work Programme for the 2022/23 municipal year.

2. Information

Economy Scrutiny Work Programme 2022/23

- 2.1 The Work Programme (**Appendix 1**) is set at the beginning of the year and considered at each meeting where it can be amended and changed as the year progresses. It outlines the work the Economy Scrutiny Committee has agreed to undertake, investigate, and focus on in the municipal year (June 2022 – June 2023) within the resources, remit, and powers available.

Referrals to scrutiny

- 2.2 Under Scrutiny Standing Order 7, any Scrutiny Member, any Combined Authority Member, or any elected Member of a West Yorkshire council (or the City of York Council) may formally refer a matter to the Committee for consideration. The referral must be in writing to the Statutory Scrutiny Officer. The Committee must then consider and discuss the referral and respond to the referrer explaining whether it will consider the matter further and why.
- 2.3 There are no formal referrals for this committee to consider.

Key decisions and call in

- 2.4 Scrutiny members may call in any decision of the Mayor, Combined Authority, a decision-making committee, and any key decisions taken by an officer (with the exception of urgent decisions). Key decisions are defined as any decision

incurring a financial cost or saving of £1 million or more, or a decision likely to have a significant effect on two or more wards.

- 2.5 Decision-makers have two days to publish notice of a decision, at which point scrutiny members have five working days to call in the decision, delaying its implementation, and formally requiring the decision maker to reconsider.
- 2.6 Any five members of a scrutiny Committee – including at least one member from two different constituent councils (West Yorkshire) – may call-in a decision by notifying the Statutory Scrutiny Officer in writing by 4.00 pm on the fifth working day following publication of a decision notice. The relevant scrutiny committee then has 14 days to scrutinise the decision and make recommendations. Further information is set out in Scrutiny Standing Order 14.
- 2.7 The latest key decisions and forward plans of key decisions are published and available for viewing on the [key decisions section of the Combined Authority's website](#).

Membership

- 2.8 Since the last meeting, there has been a change in membership.
- Councillor Sam Firth was appointed as a member of the West Yorkshire Combined Authority leaving a Leeds Conservative vacancy on this Committee.

Actions for Scrutiny Officers

- 2.9 As outlined in Scrutiny Standing Order 17, scrutiny officers provide support to a scrutiny committee's work programme and all scrutiny members in exercising their scrutiny duties and fulfilling their objectives.

3. Tackling the Climate Emergency Implications

- 3.1 There are no climate emergency implications directly arising from this report.

4. Inclusive Growth Implications

- 4.1 There are no inclusive growth implications directly arising from this report.

5. Financial Implications

- 5.1 There are no financial implications directly arising from this report.

6. Legal Implications

- 6.1 There are no legal implications directly arising from this report.

7. Staffing Implications

7.1 There are no staffing implications directly arising from this report.

8. External Consultees

8.1 No external consultations have been undertaken.

9. Recommendations

9.1 To note the Economy Scrutiny Work Programme for 2022/23.

10. Background Documents

[Key Decision Forward Plans – 2022/23](#)

11. Appendices

Appendix 1 – Joint Scrutiny Work Programme 2022/23

This page is intentionally left blank

Scrutiny Work Programmes 2022/23

Summary of main topics and meeting dates

Committee	Topic areas	Meetings
Corporate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inflation, Budget and Gainshare • Assurance Framework • Staffing (incl recruitment & retention) • Accommodation and other corporate projects (incl ICS, Cyber Security, social value in procurement) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 23 September 2022 • 18 November 2022 (Mayors Question Time) • 20 January 2023 • 10 March 2023
Transport & Infrastructure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bus Service Improvement Plan (BSIP) • Active Travel • Decarbonisation and Behaviour Change • Freight, Waterways & Rail • Consultation and Planning 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 22 September 2022 • 17 November 2022 • 19 January 2023 (Mayors Question Time) • 9 March 2023
Economy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The state of the region's economy • Cost of Living crisis • Skills and the Adult Education Budget 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21 September 2022 • 16 November 2022 • 18 January 2023 • 15 March 2023 (Mayors Question Time)
<i>All Committees</i>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mayors Pledges • Work Programme 	

Corporate Scrutiny Committee

Meetings	Topics	Attendees	Objectives
23 September 2022	Inflation & Budgets	<i>Director of Corporate</i>	Discuss the impact of inflation on strategy, projects and finances and what plans and measures are in place to mitigate the issue.
	Update – Social Value in Procurement	<i>Head of Procurement</i>	Update (from March 2022 meeting): to better understand the principles, practice, and examples of social value in procurement and suppliers.
18 November 2022	Mayor’s Question Time	<i>Mayor Tracy Brabin & Chief Executive</i>	Question the Mayor on matters pertaining to corporate scrutiny since her last attendance in November 2021.
20 January 2023	Budget, Business Planning And Workforce 2023/24	<i>Director of Corporate Director of Delivery</i>	Expand on the discussion at the November 2022 Workshop. Scrutinise the draft budget 2023/24, especially with regards to risk management, safeguards and ‘Plan Bs’ with regards to expected inflation and economic conditions.
	Update - Assurance Framework	<i>Head of Portfolio Management</i>	Consider changes to the Assurance Framework during its annual review, especially with regards to current economic pressures on capital projects.
10 March 2023	Budget and Business Planning 2023/24	Director of Finance and Commercial / Chief Operating Officer	<i>Final budget agreed by Feb CA, including figures for previous years and future projections, alongside the business plans for 2023/24</i>
	Update – Integrated Corporate System	Director of Finance and Commercial / Chief Operating Officer	Update (from March 2022): on project development and progress
10 March 2023 PRIVATE WORKSHOP	Staff Survey 2022 Results	Director of Finance and Commercial / Chief Operating Officer	<i>Overview and headlines of staff survey results – as follow on from Jan 2023 meeting and December 2022 workshop.</i>
	Update – Cyber Security	<i>Head of IT</i>	<i>Update (from March 2022): on developments and progress since</i>

Transport & Infrastructure Scrutiny Committee

Meetings	Topics	Attendees	Objectives
22 September 2022	Update – Bus Service Improvement Plan <i>(with focus on real time information)</i>	<i>Director of Transport Operations and Passenger Experience & RTI System Manager</i> --- <i>Dr Ben Hanson, Leeds University</i>	Monitor progress of Bus Service Improvement Plan (since November 2021) with particular attention to Flexi Bus Scheme and Real Time Information systems.
17 November 2022	Decarbonisation	<i>Director of Transport Operations and Passenger Experience & Head of Transport Policy</i> <i>Poss: Delivery, Strategy officers</i> --- <i>Mott Macdonald report authors</i>	Understand and identify <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. issues raised in the Mott Macdonald report and what has changed since, in terms of actions and strategies. 2. CA's direct purview/control and what can it influence indirectly. 3. possible solutions, including strategic gaps in CA decarbonisation activity e.g. waterways and inland ports, rail freight, PLVs/e-bikes, motorbikes, etc.
19 January 2023	Mayor's Question Time	<i>Mayor Tracy Brabin & Chief Executive</i>	Question the Mayor on matters pertaining to transport and infrastructure scrutiny since her last attendance in January 2022.
9 March 2023	Transport Consultations	<i>Interim Director, Transport Policy and Delivery</i> <i>Director Transport Ops and Passenger Experience</i>	Review consultation and planning processes and whether they sufficiently consider transport links and infrastructure, and whether they take into account the views of residents (especially on active travel)
	Transport in Planning	<i>Interim Director, Transport Policy and Delivery</i> <i>Director Transport Ops and Passenger Experience</i>	<i>Understand what methods are used to consult on transport schemes and whether current processes sufficiently consider the views of residents.</i>

	Freight: Rail and Waterways	<i>Interim Director, Transport Policy and Delivery</i> <i>Director Transport Ops and Passenger Experience</i>	Update requested from January 2023 MQT on: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Background: What work has the CA done on freight? What are the main challenges to moving to rail and water freight?</i> • <i>Data: How much freight is there in the region and what are the main routes</i> <i>Background: to Leeds Inland Port scheme and why it was cancelled – and if there is a possibility of continuing it, or other work on use of waterways to manage freight.</i>
	Affordable Housing	<i>Director Policing, Environment and Place</i>	<i>Update on achievement of the Mayors Pledge on affordable housing since 2021.</i>
16 February 2023 WORKSHOP	Decarbonisation	<i>Interim Director, Transport Policy and Delivery</i> <i>Director Transport Ops and Passenger Experience</i>	Follow up on issues raised and information requested at 17 November meeting

Economy Scrutiny Committee

Meetings	Topics	Attendees	Objectives
21 September 2022	Update – The state of the economy and cost of living crisis	Head of Economic Policy Research & Intelligence	Update on the state of the economy and cost of living crisis, with some attention to impact of Brexit, inflation, cost of living crisis, and skills.
16 November 2022	Adult Education Budget (AEB) and Labour Market Assessment	Head of Employment and Skills Research & Intelligence Head of Economic Policy	Explore current labour conditions and how new powers and funding from the Adult Education Budget (AEB) meets the short term and long term needs – with particular focus on if AEB to FE providers has been well spent, what success looks like and how we compare to other regions.
18 January 2023	Economic Strategy	Interim Director of Economic Services	Talk about economic strategy.
	Business Spaces and Enterprise Zones		Business space/ enterprise zones – the current data on business land and availability plus research on enterprise zones. Key sectors, history and background on enterprise zone and its current status.
15 March 2023	Mayor’s Question Time	Mayor Tracy Brabin & Chief Executive	Question the Mayor on matters pertaining to economy scrutiny since her last attendance in March 2022.

This page is intentionally left blank